

Proving Equivalence of Imperative Programs via Constrained Rewriting Induction

Carsten Fuhs (Birkbeck, University of London)

joint work with

Cynthia Kop (RU Nijmegen) and Naoki Nishida (U Nagoya)

Proof Systems for Mathematics and Verification

EPFL, Lausanne

15 June 2024

Overview

- ① Motivation
- ② Constrained Term Rewriting
- ③ Transforming C Programs
- ④ Rewriting Induction
- ⑤ Lemma Generation
- ⑥ Conclusions

Overview

- 1 Motivation
- 2 Constrained Term Rewriting
- 3 Transforming C Programs
- 4 Rewriting Induction
- 5 Lemma Generation
- 6 Conclusions

C Programming Course in Nagoya

C Programming Course in Nagoya

- ± 70 students every year (of whom 60 active)
- 3 programming exercises every week
- $\implies 180^+$ exercises to grade **every week** for a **full semester**
- student programs can be **horrible**

Exercise: write a function that calculates $\sum_{k=1}^n k$.

```
int sum(int x) {  
    int i = 0, z = 0;  
    for (i = 0; i <= x; i++)  
        z += i;  
    return z;  
}
```

```
int sum( int n ){
    if(n < 0){
        return 0;
    }
    int cnt;
    int data = 0;
    for(cnt = 0; cnt <= n; cnt++){
        data = data + cnt;
    }
    return data;
}
```



```
int sum(int n)
{
  if ( n<=0 ) {
    return 0;
  } else {
    return (n*(n+1)/2);
  }
}
```

```
int sum(int x) {  
    int i, j, z;  
    z = 0;  
    for (i = 0; i <= x; i++)  
        for (j = 0; j < i; j++)  
            z++;  
    return z;  
}
```

Solutions

Solutions

- hire some teaching assistants!

Solutions

- hire some teaching assistants!
- automate the marking

Solutions

- hire some teaching assistants!
- automate the marking

Automated Program Testing

Automated Program Testing

- run automatic tests

Automated Program Testing

- run automatic tests
- prove that programs are correct!

Automated Program Testing

- run automatic tests
- **prove that programs are correct!**

Automated Program Testing

- run automatic tests
- **prove that programs are correct!**
 - we love to play with term rewriting

Automated Program Testing

- run automatic tests
- **prove that programs are correct!**
 - we love to play with term rewriting
 - \Rightarrow convert C programs to term rewriting systems!

Automated Program Testing

- run automatic tests
- **prove that programs are correct!**
 - we love to play with term rewriting
 - \Rightarrow convert C programs to term rewriting systems!
 - \Rightarrow reason about those TRSs instead!

Overview

- 1 Motivation
- 2 Constrained Term Rewriting**
- 3 Transforming C Programs
- 4 Rewriting Induction
- 5 Lemma Generation
- 6 Conclusions

What's Term Rewriting?

What's Term Rewriting?

Syntactic approach for reasoning in equational first-order logic

What's Term Rewriting?

Syntactic approach for reasoning in equational first-order logic

Core functional programming language without many restrictions (and features) of “real” FP:

What's Term Rewriting?

Syntactic approach for reasoning in equational first-order logic

Core functional programming language without many restrictions (and features) of “real” FP:

- first-order (usually)
- no fixed evaluation strategy
- no fixed order of rules to apply (Haskell: top to bottom)
- untyped
- no pre-defined data structures (integers, arrays, ...)

Summing up Natural Numbers

Numbers: $0, s(0), s(s(0)), \dots$

Summing up Natural Numbers

Numbers: $0, s(0), s(s(0)), \dots$

Rules:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}(0) &\rightarrow 0 \\ \text{sum}(s(x)) &\rightarrow \text{plus}(s(x), \text{sum}(x)) \\ \text{plus}(0, y) &\rightarrow y \\ \text{plus}(s(x), y) &\rightarrow s(\text{plus}(x, y)) \end{aligned}$$

Summing up Natural Numbers

Numbers: $0, s(0), s(s(0)), \dots$

Rules:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}(0) &\rightarrow 0 \\ \text{sum}(s(x)) &\rightarrow \text{plus}(s(x), \text{sum}(x)) \\ \text{plus}(0, y) &\rightarrow y \\ \text{plus}(s(x), y) &\rightarrow s(\text{plus}(x, y)) \end{aligned}$$

Then e.g. we can compute $1 + 1 = 2$ as

$$\text{plus}(s(0), s(0)) \rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}} s(\text{plus}(0, s(0))) \rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}} s(s(0))$$

Summing up Natural Numbers

Numbers: $0, s(0), s(s(0)), \dots$

Rules:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}(0) &\rightarrow 0 \\ \text{sum}(s(x)) &\rightarrow \text{plus}(s(x), \text{sum}(x)) \\ \text{plus}(0, y) &\rightarrow y \\ \text{plus}(s(x), y) &\rightarrow s(\text{plus}(x, y)) \end{aligned}$$

Then e.g. we can compute $1 + 1 = 2$ as

$$\text{plus}(s(0), s(0)) \rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}} s(\text{plus}(0, s(0))) \rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}} s(s(0))$$

Integer arithmetic possible with more complex recursive rules.

Summing up Natural Numbers

Numbers: $0, s(0), s(s(0)), \dots$

Rules:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}(0) &\rightarrow 0 \\ \text{sum}(s(x)) &\rightarrow \text{plus}(s(x), \text{sum}(x)) \\ \text{plus}(0, y) &\rightarrow y \\ \text{plus}(s(x), y) &\rightarrow s(\text{plus}(x, y)) \end{aligned}$$

Then e.g. we can compute $1 + 1 = 2$ as

$$\text{plus}(s(0), s(0)) \rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}} s(\text{plus}(0, s(0))) \rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}} s(s(0))$$

Integer arithmetic possible with more complex recursive rules.

But: Want to do **program analysis**. Really throw away domain knowledge about built-in data structures?!

What's Constrained Term Rewriting?

Term rewriting “with batteries included”

- first-order
- no fixed evaluation strategy
- no fixed order of rules to apply

What's Constrained Term Rewriting?

Term rewriting “with batteries included”

- first-order
- no fixed evaluation strategy
- no fixed order of rules to apply
- **typed**

What's Constrained Term Rewriting?

Term rewriting “with batteries included”

- first-order
- no fixed evaluation strategy
- no fixed order of rules to apply
- typed
- with pre-defined data structures (integers, arrays, bitvectors, ...), usually from SMT-LIB theories (SMT: SAT Modulo Theories)

What's Constrained Term Rewriting?

Term rewriting “with batteries included”

- first-order
- no fixed evaluation strategy
- no fixed order of rules to apply
- typed
- with pre-defined data structures (integers, arrays, bitvectors, ...), usually from SMT-LIB theories (SMT: SAT Modulo Theories)
- rewrite rules with SMT constraints

What's Constrained Term Rewriting?

Term rewriting “with batteries included”

- first-order
- no fixed evaluation strategy
- no fixed order of rules to apply
- typed
- with pre-defined data structures (integers, arrays, bitvectors, ...), usually from SMT-LIB theories (SMT: SAT Modulo Theories)
- rewrite rules with SMT constraints

⇒ Term rewriting + SMT solving for automated reasoning

Integer Summation

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}(x) & \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}(x) & \rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) & [x > 0] \end{array}$$

Integer Summation

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$$

$\text{sum}(2)$

Integer Summation

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}(x) & \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}(x) & \rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) & [x > 0] \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{l} \text{sum}(2) \\ \rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(2 - 1) \end{array}$$

Integer Summation

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(2)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(2 - 1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(1)$$

Integer Summation

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(2)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(2 - 1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + \text{sum}(1 - 1))$$

Integer Summation

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(2)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(2 - 1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + \text{sum}(1 - 1))$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + \text{sum}(0))$$

Integer Summation

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(2)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(2 - 1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + \text{sum}(1 - 1))$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + \text{sum}(0))$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + 0)$$

Integer Summation

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$$

sum(2)

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(2 - 1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + \text{sum}(1 - 1))$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + \text{sum}(0))$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + 0)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + 1$$

Integer Summation

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$$

$$\text{sum}(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$$

sum(2)

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(2 - 1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + \text{sum}(1)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + \text{sum}(1 - 1))$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + \text{sum}(0))$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + (1 + 0)$$

$$\rightarrow 2 + 1$$

$$\rightarrow 3$$

Integer Summation

$$\begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}(x) & \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}(x) & \rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) & [x > 0] \end{array}$$

- $\mathcal{F}_{terms} = \{\text{sum}\} \cup \{n \mid n \in \mathbb{Z}\}$
- $\mathcal{F}_{theory} = \{+, -, \geq, >, \wedge, \text{true}, \text{false}\} \cup \{n \mid n \in \mathbb{Z}\}$
- **Values:** true, false, 0, 1, 2, 3, ..., -1, -2, ...
- **Interpretation:** addition, minus, etc.

Bitvector Summation

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}(x) &\rightarrow 0 && [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}(x) &\rightarrow x + \text{sum}(x - 1) && [x > 0] \end{aligned}$$

- $\mathcal{F}_{\text{terms}} = \{\text{sum}\} \cup \{\mathbf{n} \mid n \in \mathbb{Z} \wedge 0 \leq n < 256\}$
- $\mathcal{F}_{\text{theory}} = \{+, -, \geq, >, \wedge, \text{true}, \text{false}\} \cup \{\mathbf{n} \mid n \in \mathbb{Z} \wedge 0 \leq n < 256\}$
- **Values:** true, false, 0, 1, 2, 3, ..., 255
- **Interpretation:** addition, minus, etc. modulo 256

Array Summation

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}(a, x) &\rightarrow 0 && [x < 0] \\ \text{sum}(a, x) &\rightarrow \text{select}(a, x) + \text{sum}(a, x - 1) && [x \geq 0] \end{aligned}$$

- $\mathcal{F}_{\text{terms}} = \{\text{sum}\} \cup \{n : \text{int} \mid n \in \mathbb{Z}\} \cup \{a : \text{iarr} \mid n \in \mathbb{Z}^*\}$
- $\mathcal{F}_{\text{theory}} =$
 $\{+, -, \geq, >, \wedge, \text{select}, \text{true}, \text{false}\} \cup \{n \mid n \in \mathbb{Z}\} \cup$
 $\{a : \text{iarr} \mid a \in \mathbb{Z}^*\}$
- Values:
 $\text{true}, \text{false}, 0, 1, -1, 2, -2, \dots, (), (0), (1), \dots, (0, 0), \dots$

Logically Constrained Term Rewriting Systems

[Kop and Nishida, 2013]

Logically Constrained Term Rewriting Systems

[Kop and Nishida, 2013]

- work much like normal term rewrite systems

Logically Constrained Term Rewriting Systems

[Kop and Nishida, 2013]

- work much like normal term rewrite systems
- can handle integers, **arrays**, **bitvectors**, ...

Logically Constrained Term Rewriting Systems

[Kop and Nishida, 2013]

- work much like normal term rewrite systems
- can handle integers, **arrays**, **bitvectors**, ...
- are flexible enough to faithfully model (many) real-world programs

Overview

- 1 Motivation
- 2 Constrained Term Rewriting
- 3 Transforming C Programs**
- 4 Rewriting Induction
- 5 Lemma Generation
- 6 Conclusions

Factorial

```
int fact(int x) {  
    int z = 1;  
    for (int i = 1; i <= x; i++)  
        z *= i;  
    return z;  
}
```

Factorial

```
int fact(int x) {
  int z = 1;
  for (int i = 1; i <= x; i++)
    z *= i;
  return z;
}
```

$$\begin{array}{lll}
 \text{fact}(x) & \rightarrow & u_1(x) \\
 u_1(x) & \rightarrow & u_2(x, 1, 1) \\
 u_2(x, z, i) & \rightarrow & u_3(x, z, i) & [i \leq x] \\
 u_2(x, z, i) & \rightarrow & u_4(x, z, i) & [\neg(i \leq x)] \\
 u_3(x, z, i) & \rightarrow & u_2(x, z * i, i + 1) \\
 u_4(x, z, i) & \rightarrow & z
 \end{array}$$

Factorial

```
int fact(int x) {  
    int z = 1;  
    for (int i = 1; i <= x; i++)  
        z *= i;  
    return z;  
}
```

$$\begin{aligned} \text{fact}(x) &\rightarrow \text{u}_2(x, 1, 1) \\ \text{u}_2(x, z, i) &\rightarrow \text{u}_2(x, z * i, i + 1) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}_2(x, z, i) &\rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{aligned}$$

Factorial

```
int fact(int x) {  
    int z = 1;  
    for (int i = 1; i <= x; i++)  
        z *= i;  
    return z;  
}
```

$$\begin{aligned} \text{fact}(x) &\rightarrow \text{u}_2(x, 1, 1) \\ \text{u}_2(x, z, i) &\rightarrow \text{u}_2(x, z * i, i + 1) \quad [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}_2(x, z, i) &\rightarrow \text{return}(z) \quad [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{aligned}$$

Division by Zero

```
boolean divides(int x, int y) {  
    return x % y == 0;  
}
```

Division by Zero

```
boolean divides(int x, int y) {  
    return x % y == 0;  
}
```

$\text{divides}(x, y) \rightarrow \text{return}(x \bmod y = 0)$

Division by Zero

```
boolean divides(int x, int y) {
  return x % y == 0;
}
```

| | | | |
|---|---------------|---|--------------|
| <code>divides(x, y)</code> | \rightarrow | <code>return($x \bmod y = 0$)</code> | $[y \neq 0]$ |
| <code>divides(x, y)</code> | \rightarrow | <code>error</code> | $[y = 0]$ |

Integer Overflow

```
int fact(int x) {
  int z = 1;
  for (int i = 1; i <= x; i++)
    z *= i;
  return z;
}
```

$$\text{fact}(x) \rightarrow u_2(x, 1, 1)$$

$$u_2(x, z, i) \rightarrow u_2(x, z * i, i + 1) [i \leq x]$$

$$u_2(x, z, i) \rightarrow \text{return}(z) \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$$

Integer Overflow

```
int fact(int x) {
  int z = 1;
  for (int i = 1; i <= x; i++)
    z *= i;
  return z;
}
```

$\text{fact}(x) \rightarrow u_2(x, 1, 1)$

$u_2(x, z, i) \rightarrow u_2(x, z * i, i + 1) [i \leq x \wedge z * i < 256 \wedge i + 1 < 256]$

$u_2(x, z, i) \rightarrow \text{error} [i \leq x \wedge (z * i \geq 256 \vee i + 1 \geq 256)]$

$u_2(x, z, i) \rightarrow \text{return}(z) [\neg(i \leq x)]$

Further Extensions

Can also handle

- Recursion
- Global variables
- Mutable arrays (with built-in size function)
→ can represent memory safety violation

Overview

- 1 Motivation
- 2 Constrained Term Rewriting
- 3 Transforming C Programs
- 4 Rewriting Induction**
- 5 Lemma Generation
- 6 Conclusions

What is Equivalence for LCTRSs?

Teacher's code:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}_1(x) &\rightarrow 0 && [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) &\rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) && [x > 0] \end{aligned}$$

What is Equivalence for LCTRSs?

Teacher's code:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}_1(x) &\rightarrow 0 && [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) &\rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) && [x > 0] \end{aligned}$$

Student's code:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}_2(x) &\rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, 0, 0) \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) &\rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) && [i \leq x] \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) &\rightarrow z && [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{aligned}$$

What is Equivalence for LCTRSs?

Teacher's code:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}_1(x) &\rightarrow 0 && [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) &\rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) && [x > 0] \end{aligned}$$

Student's code:

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}_2(x) &\rightarrow u(x, 0, 0) \\ u(x, i, z) &\rightarrow u(x, i + 1, z + i) && [i \leq x] \\ u(x, i, z) &\rightarrow z && [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{aligned}$$

Query: $\text{sum}_1(x) \leftrightarrow^* \text{sum}_2(x)$ for all x ?

Rewriting Induction

Given:

- set \mathcal{E} of equations $s_1 \approx t_1 [\varphi_1], \dots, s_n \approx t_n [\varphi_n]$

Rewriting Induction

Given:

- set \mathcal{E} of equations $s_1 \approx t_1 [\varphi_1], \dots, s_n \approx t_n [\varphi_n]$
- set of rewrite rules \mathcal{R}

Rewriting Induction

Given:

- set \mathcal{E} of equations $s_1 \approx t_1 [\varphi_1], \dots, s_n \approx t_n [\varphi_n]$
- set of rewrite rules \mathcal{R}

Want to prove:

for all constructor ground substitutions $\gamma_1, \dots, \gamma_n$ compatible with $\varphi_1, \dots, \varphi_n$: each $s_i \gamma_i \leftrightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}^* t_i \gamma_i$.

Rewriting Induction

Given:

- set \mathcal{E} of equations $s_1 \approx t_1 [\varphi_1], \dots, s_n \approx t_n [\varphi_n]$
- set of rewrite rules \mathcal{R}

Want to prove:

for all constructor ground substitutions $\gamma_1, \dots, \gamma_n$ compatible with $\varphi_1, \dots, \varphi_n$: each $s_i \gamma_i \leftrightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}^* t_i \gamma_i$.

Requirements:

- termination of $\rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}$ (to perform induction)

Rewriting Induction

Given:

- set \mathcal{E} of equations $s_1 \approx t_1 [\varphi_1], \dots, s_n \approx t_n [\varphi_n]$
- set of rewrite rules \mathcal{R}

Want to prove:

for all constructor ground substitutions $\gamma_1, \dots, \gamma_n$ compatible with $\varphi_1, \dots, \varphi_n$: each $s_i \gamma_i \leftrightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}^* t_i \gamma_i$.

Requirements:

- termination of $\rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}$ (to perform induction)
- sufficient completeness of $\rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}$: evaluation “cannot get stuck” (for case analysis over variables by constructor terms)

Rewriting Induction

Given:

- set \mathcal{E} of equations $s_1 \approx t_1 [\varphi_1], \dots, s_n \approx t_n [\varphi_n]$
- set of rewrite rules \mathcal{R}

Want to prove:

for all constructor ground substitutions $\gamma_1, \dots, \gamma_n$ compatible with $\varphi_1, \dots, \varphi_n$: each $s_i \gamma_i \leftrightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}^* t_i \gamma_i$.

Requirements:

- termination of $\rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}$ (to perform induction)
- sufficient completeness of $\rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}$: evaluation “cannot get stuck” (for case analysis over variables by constructor terms)
- if we want $s_i \gamma_i \leftrightarrow^* t_i \gamma_i$ for **all** results: confluence of $\rightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}$

Rewriting Induction

Three sets:

- \mathcal{E} (equations, “the queries”)
- \mathcal{R} (rules, “the program”)
- \mathcal{H} (rules, “induction hypotheses”)

Rewriting Induction

Three sets:

- \mathcal{E} (equations, “the queries”)
- \mathcal{R} (rules, “the program”)
- \mathcal{H} (rules, “induction hypotheses”)

Initially: \mathcal{E} given, \mathcal{R} given, \mathcal{H} empty

Rewriting Induction

Three sets:

- \mathcal{E} (equations, “the queries”)
- \mathcal{R} (rules, “the program”)
- \mathcal{H} (rules, “induction hypotheses”)

Initially: \mathcal{E} given, \mathcal{R} given, \mathcal{H} empty

Proof steps: pairs $(\mathcal{E}, \mathcal{H}) \vdash (\mathcal{E}', \mathcal{H}')$ by several inference rules for \vdash

Rewriting Induction

Three sets:

- \mathcal{E} (equations, “the queries”)
- \mathcal{R} (rules, “the program”)
- \mathcal{H} (rules, “induction hypotheses”)

Initially: \mathcal{E} given, \mathcal{R} given, \mathcal{H} empty

Proof steps: pairs $(\mathcal{E}, \mathcal{H}) \vdash (\mathcal{E}', \mathcal{H}')$ by several inference rules for \vdash

Invariant: $\rightarrow_{\mathcal{R} \cup \mathcal{H}}$ terminating

Rewriting Induction

Three sets:

- \mathcal{E} (equations, “the queries”)
- \mathcal{R} (rules, “the program”)
- \mathcal{H} (rules, “induction hypotheses”)

Initially: \mathcal{E} given, \mathcal{R} given, \mathcal{H} empty

Proof steps: pairs $(\mathcal{E}, \mathcal{H}) \vdash (\mathcal{E}', \mathcal{H}')$ by several inference rules for \vdash

Invariant: $\rightarrow_{\mathcal{R} \cup \mathcal{H}}$ terminating

Goal: find derivation $(\mathcal{E}, \emptyset) \vdash^* (\emptyset, \mathcal{H})$

Then also $\leftrightarrow_{\mathcal{E}}^* \subseteq \leftrightarrow_{\mathcal{R} \cup \mathcal{H}}^* \subseteq \leftrightarrow_{\mathcal{R}}^*$ on ground terms:

Equations \mathcal{E} are **inductive theorems** for \mathcal{R}

Simplification: definition

$$\frac{(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{s \simeq t [\varphi]\}, \mathcal{H})}{(\mathcal{E} \cup \{s' \approx t [\psi]\}, \mathcal{H})}$$

$$\text{if } s \approx t [\varphi] \rightarrow_{\mathcal{R} \cup \mathcal{H}} s' \approx t [\psi]$$

Idea: Use the program or an induction hypothesis to simplify the query.

Simplification: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{ \text{u}(x, y, z) \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1] \}, \mathcal{H})$$

Simplification: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{ \mathbf{u}(x, y, z) \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1] \}, \mathcal{H})$$

Simplification: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{ \mathbf{u}(x, y + 1, z + y) \approx x + \mathbf{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1] \}, \mathcal{H})$$

Simplification: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{ \text{u}(x, \mathbf{y} + 1, z + y) \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq \mathbf{y} \wedge x = x' + 1] \}, \mathcal{H})$$

Simplification: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{\text{u}(x, y', z + y) \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1]\}, \mathcal{H})$$

Simplification: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{\text{u}(x, y', z + y) \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1]\}, \mathcal{H})$$

Simplification: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{\text{u}(x, y', z') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y]\}, \mathcal{H})$$

Expansion: definition

$$\frac{(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{s \simeq t [\varphi]\}, \mathcal{H})}{(\mathcal{E} \cup \text{Expd}(s \approx t [\varphi], p), \mathcal{H} \cup \{s \rightarrow t [\varphi]\})}$$

if for every γ compatible with φ , $s|_p$ reduces and $\mathcal{R} \cup \mathcal{H} \cup \{s \rightarrow t [\varphi]\}$ is terminating

Expansion: definition

$$\frac{(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{s \simeq t [\varphi]\}, \mathcal{H})}{(\mathcal{E} \cup \text{Expd}(s \approx t [\varphi], p), \mathcal{H} \cup \{s \rightarrow t [\varphi]\})}$$

if for every γ compatible with φ , $s|_p$ reduces and $\mathcal{R} \cup \mathcal{H} \cup \{s \rightarrow t [\varphi]\}$ is terminating

$\text{Expd}(C[l']_p \approx t [\varphi], p)$ contains equations $C[r\gamma]_p \approx t\gamma [\varphi\gamma \wedge \psi\gamma]$ for all $l \rightarrow r [\psi]$ in \mathcal{R} where l and l' unify with most general unifier γ

Expansion: definition

$$\frac{(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{s \simeq t [\varphi]\}, \mathcal{H})}{(\mathcal{E} \cup \text{Expd}(s \approx t [\varphi], p), \mathcal{H} \cup \{s \rightarrow t [\varphi]\})}$$

if for every γ compatible with φ , $s|_p$ reduces and $\mathcal{R} \cup \mathcal{H} \cup \{s \rightarrow t [\varphi]\}$ is terminating

$\text{Expd}(C[l']_p \approx t [\varphi], p)$ contains equations $C[r\gamma]_p \approx t\gamma [\varphi\gamma \wedge \psi\gamma]$ for all $l \rightarrow r [\psi]$ in \mathcal{R} where l and l' unify with most general unifier γ

Idea: Exhaustive case analysis, generate induction hypothesis.
(Closely related: narrowing.)

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{\text{u}(x, y', z') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y]\}, \mathcal{H})$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{ \mathbf{u}(x, y', z') \approx x + \mathbf{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \}, \mathcal{H})$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y' + 1, z' + y') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \}) \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y' + 1, z' + y') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y' + 1, z' + y') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y' + 1, z' + y') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y' + 1, z' + y') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y' + 1, z' + y') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \mathbf{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \mathbf{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \mathbf{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \mathbf{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \} \} \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \}) [y := y', y' := y'', z := z', z' := z''] \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \}) \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \}) [y := y', y' := y'', z := z', z' := z''] \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \}) [y := y', y' := y'', z := z', z' := z''] \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \}) [y := y', y' := y'', z := z', z' := z''] \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y'', z'') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y'] \} \\ & \cup \{ z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)] \} \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \}) [y := y', y' := y'', z := z', z' := z''] \end{aligned}$$

Expansion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{x + \text{u}(x', y', z') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = \\ & \quad y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y']\} \\ & \cup \{z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)]\}) \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{\text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y]\}) \end{aligned}$$

Deletion: definition

$$\frac{(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{s \simeq t [\varphi]\}, \mathcal{H})}{(\mathcal{E}, \mathcal{H})}$$

if $s \equiv t$ or φ is unsatisfiable

Idea: Delete trivial inductive theorems.

Deletion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \mathbf{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \mathbf{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{x + \mathbf{u}(x', y', z') \approx x + \mathbf{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = \\ & \quad y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y']\} \\ & \cup \{z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \\ & \quad \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)]\}) \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{\mathbf{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \mathbf{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y]\}) \end{aligned}$$

Deletion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{x + \text{u}(x', y', z') \approx x + \text{u}(x', y', z') [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = \\ & \quad y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \wedge y' \leq x \wedge y'' = y' + 1 \wedge z'' = z' + y']\} \\ & \cup \{z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \\ & \quad \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)]\}) \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{\text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y]\}) \end{aligned}$$

Deletion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

 $(\mathcal{E} \cup$

$$\begin{aligned} & \{z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \\ & \quad \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)]\} \\ , \mathcal{H} \cup & \{\text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y]\} \end{aligned}$$

EQ-Deletion: definition

$$\frac{(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{C[s_1, \dots, s_n] \approx C[t_1, \dots, t_n] [\varphi]\}, \mathcal{H})}{(\mathcal{E} \cup \{C[\vec{s}] \approx C[\vec{t}] [\varphi \wedge \neg \bigwedge_{i=1}^n (s_i = t_i)]\}, \mathcal{H})}$$

if $s_1, \dots, s_n, t_1, \dots, t_n$ all logical terms

Idea: If all arguments to the same context become equal, we're done.

EQ-Deletion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$(\mathcal{E} \cup \{z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \\ \wedge \neg(y' \leq x)]\})$$

$$, \mathcal{H} \cup \{\text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ \wedge z' = z + y]\})$$

EQ-Deletion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \\ & \quad \wedge \neg(y' \leq x) \wedge \neg(z' = x + z)]\}) \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{\text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y]\}) \end{aligned}$$

EQ-Deletion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\mathcal{E} \cup \{z' \approx x + z [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y \\ & \quad \wedge \neg(y' \leq x) \wedge \neg(z' = x + z)]\}) \\ & , \mathcal{H} \cup \{\text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \\ & \quad \wedge z' = z + y]\}) \end{aligned}$$

EQ-Deletion: example

$$\mathcal{R} = \left\{ \begin{array}{ll} \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 & [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) & [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) & \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) & [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z & [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array} \right\}$$

(\mathcal{E})

$$, \mathcal{H} \cup \{ \text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \}$$

Postulate: definition

$$\frac{(\mathcal{E}, \mathcal{H})}{(\mathcal{E} \uplus \{s \approx t [\varphi]\}, \mathcal{H})}$$

Postulate: example

 \mathcal{R} :

$$\begin{array}{lll} \text{sum}_1(x) & \rightarrow & 0 \quad [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) & \rightarrow & x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) & \rightarrow & \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) & \rightarrow & \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) & \rightarrow & z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{array}$$

Goal:

$$(\{ \text{sum}_1(x) \approx \text{sum}_2(x) \ [\top] \}, \emptyset)$$

Postulate: example

 \mathcal{R} :

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}_1(x) &\rightarrow 0 && [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) &\rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) && [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) &\rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) &\rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) && [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) &\rightarrow z && [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{aligned}$$

Goal:

$$\left(\{ \text{sum}_1(x) \approx \text{sum}_2(x) \ [\top], \right. \\ \left. \text{u}(x, y, z) \approx x + \text{u}(x', y, z) \ [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y] \}, \emptyset \right)$$

Postulate: example

 \mathcal{R} :

$$\begin{aligned} \text{sum}_1(x) &\rightarrow 0 && [x \leq 0] \\ \text{sum}_1(x) &\rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) && [x > 0] \\ \text{sum}_2(x) &\rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) &\rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) && [i \leq x] \\ \text{u}(x, i, z) &\rightarrow z && [\neg(i \leq x)] \end{aligned}$$

Goal:

$$\left(\begin{aligned} &\{\text{sum}_1(x) \approx \text{sum}_2(x) [\top]\}, \\ &\{\text{u}(x, y', z') \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', y, z) [x \geq y \wedge x = x' + 1 \\ &\quad \wedge y' = y + 1 \wedge z' = z + y]\} \end{aligned} \right)$$

Overview

- 1 Motivation
- 2 Constrained Term Rewriting
- 3 Transforming C Programs
- 4 Rewriting Induction
- 5 Lemma Generation**
- 6 Conclusions

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0$ $[x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ $[x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i)$ $[i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z$ $[\neg(i \leq x)]$

Goals:

$$\text{sum}_1(x) \approx \text{sum}_2(x) \quad [\top]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$

Goals:

$$\text{sum}_1(x) \approx \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [\top]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [\top]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \approx \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [x > 0]$$

$$0 \approx \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [x \leq 0]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [\top]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \approx \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [x > 0]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [\top]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \approx \text{u}(x, 0 + 1, 0 + 0) \quad [x > 0]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [\top]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{sum}_1(x') \approx \text{u}(x, 1, 0) \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [\top]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{u}(x', 0, 0) \approx \text{u}(x, 1, 0) \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [\top]$
- H2 $\text{u}(x, 1, 0) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 0, 0) \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{u}(x', 0, 0) \approx \text{u}(x, 1 + 1, 0 + 1) \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1 \wedge x' > 0]$$

$$x + \text{u}(x', 0, 0) \approx 0 \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1 \wedge x' \leq 0]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [\top]$
- H2 $\text{u}(x, 1, 0) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 0, 0) \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{u}(x', 0, 0) \approx \text{u}(x, 1 + 1, 0 + 1) \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1 \wedge x' > 0]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [\top]$
- H2 $\text{u}(x, 1, 0) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 0, 0) \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{u}(x', 0 + 1, 0 + 0) \approx \text{u}(x, 1 + 1, 0 + 1) \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1 \wedge x' > 0]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0 \quad [x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0) \quad [\top]$
- H2 $\text{u}(x, 1, 0) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 0, 0) \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{u}(x', 1, 0) \approx \text{u}(x, 2, 1) \quad [x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1 \wedge x' > 0]$$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0$ $[x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ $[x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow u(x, 0, 0)$
4. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow u(x, i + 1, z + i)$ $[i \leq x]$
5. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow z$ $[\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow u(x, 0, 0)$ $[\top]$
- H2 $u(x, 1, 0) \rightarrow x + u(x', 0, 0)$ $[x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1]$
- H3 $u(x, 2, 1) \rightarrow x + u(x', 1, 0)$ $[x \geq 1 \wedge x' = x - 1]$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0$ $[x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ $[x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i)$ $[i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z$ $[\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$ $[\top]$
- H2 $\text{u}(x, 1, 0) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 0, 0)$ $[x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1]$
- H3 $\text{u}(x, 2, 1) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 1, 0)$ $[x \geq 1 \wedge x' = x - 1]$
- H4 $\text{u}(x, 3, 3) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 2, 1)$ $[x \geq 2 \wedge x' = x - 1]$

What Typically Happens

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0$ $[x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ $[x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i)$ $[i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z$ $[\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$ $[\top]$
- H2 $\text{u}(x, 1, 0) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 0, 0)$ $[x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1]$
- H3 $\text{u}(x, 2, 1) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 1, 0)$ $[x \geq 1 \wedge x' = x - 1]$
- H4 $\text{u}(x, 3, 3) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 2, 1)$ $[x \geq 2 \wedge x' = x - 1]$
- H5 $\text{u}(x, 4, 6) \rightarrow x + \text{u}(x', 3, 3)$ $[x \geq 3 \wedge x' = x - 1]$

Use Different Notation!

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow 0$ $[x \leq 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ $[x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, 0, 0)$
4. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow \text{u}(x, i + 1, z + i)$ $[i \leq x]$
5. $\text{u}(x, i, z) \rightarrow z$ $[\neg(i \leq x)]$

Use Different Notation!

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow c0$ $[x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ $[x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2)$ $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$
4. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow u(x, i + 1, z + i)$ $[i \leq x]$
5. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow z$ $[\neg(i \leq x)]$

Use Different Notation!

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow c0$ $[x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ $[x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2)$ $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$
4. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow u(x, i + 1, z + i)$ $[i \leq x]$
5. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow z$ $[\neg(i \leq x)]$

Goals:

$$\text{sum}_1(x) \approx \text{sum}_2(x) [\top]$$

Use Different Notation!

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow c0$ $[x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ $[x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2)$ $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$
4. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow u(x, i + 1, z + i)$ $[i \leq x]$
5. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow z$ $[\neg(i \leq x)]$

Goals:

$$\text{sum}_1(x) \approx u(x, c1, c2) [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$$

Use Different Notation!

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow c0 \quad [x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$
 2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
 3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2) \quad [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$
 4. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow u(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
 5. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2) \quad [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \approx u(x, c1, c2) \quad [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0 \wedge x > 0]$$

$$c0 \approx u(x, c1, c2) \quad [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0 \wedge x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$$

Use Different Notation!

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow c0$ $[x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ $[x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2)$ $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$
4. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow u(x, i + 1, z + i)$ $[i \leq x]$
5. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow z$ $[\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2)$ $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \approx u(x, c1, c2) [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0 \wedge x > 0]$$

Use Different Notation!

- | | | | | |
|----|-------------------|---------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|
| 1. | $\text{sum}_1(x)$ | \rightarrow | $c0$ | $[x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$ |
| 2. | $\text{sum}_1(x)$ | \rightarrow | $x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ | $[x > 0]$ |
| 3. | $\text{sum}_2(x)$ | \rightarrow | $u(x, c1, c2)$ | $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$ |
| 4. | $u(x, i, z)$ | \rightarrow | $u(x, i + 1, z + i)$ | $[i \leq x]$ |
| 5. | $u(x, i, z)$ | \rightarrow | z | $[\neg(i \leq x)]$ |
| H1 | $\text{sum}_1(x)$ | \rightarrow | $u(x, c1, c2)$ | $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$ |

Goals:

$$x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \approx u(x, c1 + 1, c2 + c1) [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0 \wedge x > 0]$$

Use Different Notation!

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow c0 \quad [x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1) \quad [x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2) \quad [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$
4. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow u(x, i + 1, z + i) \quad [i \leq x]$
5. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow z \quad [\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2) \quad [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$

Goals:

$$x + \text{sum}_1(x') \approx u(x, i, z) \quad [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0 \wedge x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1 \wedge i = c1 + 1 \wedge z = c1 + c2]$$

Use Different Notation!

1. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow c0$ $[x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$
2. $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ $[x > 0]$
3. $\text{sum}_2(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2)$ $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$
4. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow u(x, i + 1, z + i)$ $[i \leq x]$
5. $u(x, i, z) \rightarrow z$ $[\neg(i \leq x)]$
- H1 $\text{sum}_1(x) \rightarrow u(x, c1, c2)$ $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$

Goals:

$$x + u(x', c1, c2) \approx u(x, i, z) [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0 \wedge x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1 \wedge i = c1 + 1 \wedge z = c1 + c2]$$

Use Different Notation!

- | | | | | |
|----|-------------------|---------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|
| 1. | $\text{sum}_1(x)$ | \rightarrow | $c0$ | $[x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$ |
| 2. | $\text{sum}_1(x)$ | \rightarrow | $x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ | $[x > 0]$ |
| 3. | $\text{sum}_2(x)$ | \rightarrow | $u(x, c1, c2)$ | $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$ |
| 4. | $u(x, i, z)$ | \rightarrow | $u(x, i + 1, z + i)$ | $[i \leq x]$ |
| 5. | $u(x, i, z)$ | \rightarrow | z | $[\neg(i \leq x)]$ |
| H1 | $\text{sum}_1(x)$ | \rightarrow | $u(x, c1, c2)$ | $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$ |

Goals:

$$x + u(x', c1, c2) \approx u(x, i, z) [c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0 \wedge x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1 \wedge i = c1 + 1 \wedge z = c1 + c2]$$

Generalisation: Drop initialisations

Use Different Notation!

| | | | | |
|----|-------------------|---------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|
| 1. | $\text{sum}_1(x)$ | \rightarrow | $c0$ | $[x \leq 0 \wedge c0 = 0]$ |
| 2. | $\text{sum}_1(x)$ | \rightarrow | $x + \text{sum}_1(x - 1)$ | $[x > 0]$ |
| 3. | $\text{sum}_2(x)$ | \rightarrow | $u(x, c1, c2)$ | $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$ |
| 4. | $u(x, i, z)$ | \rightarrow | $u(x, i + 1, z + i)$ | $[i \leq x]$ |
| 5. | $u(x, i, z)$ | \rightarrow | z | $[\neg(i \leq x)]$ |
| H1 | $\text{sum}_1(x)$ | \rightarrow | $u(x, c1, c2)$ | $[c1 = 0 \wedge c2 = 0]$ |

Goals:

$$x + u(x', c1, c2) \approx u(x, i, z) \quad [\quad x > 0 \wedge x' = x - 1 \wedge i = c1 + 1 \wedge z = c1 + c2]$$

Generalisation: Drop initialisations

Overview

- 1 Motivation
- 2 Constrained Term Rewriting
- 3 Transforming C Programs
- 4 Rewriting Induction
- 5 Lemma Generation
- 6 Conclusions**

Shoulders of Giants

Shoulders of Giants

- various kinds of constrained rewriting

Shoulders of Giants

- various kinds of constrained rewriting
(But: most were fundamentally limited to the integers)

Shoulders of Giants

- various kinds of constrained rewriting
(But: most were fundamentally limited to the integers)
- long history of **unconstrained** rewriting induction, e.g.
[Reddy 1990]

Shoulders of Giants

- various kinds of constrained rewriting
(But: most were fundamentally limited to the integers)
- long history of **unconstrained** rewriting induction, e.g.
[Reddy 1990]
(But: lemma generation methods do not obviously extend)

Shoulders of Giants

- various kinds of constrained rewriting
(But: most were fundamentally limited to the integers)
- long history of **unconstrained** rewriting induction, e.g. [Reddy 1990]
(But: lemma generation methods do not obviously extend)
- rewriting induction for a form of constrained rewriting

Shoulders of Giants

- various kinds of constrained rewriting
(But: most were fundamentally limited to the integers)
- long history of **unconstrained** rewriting induction, e.g. [Reddy 1990]
(But: lemma generation methods do not obviously extend)
- rewriting induction for a form of constrained rewriting
(But: only very complex and relatively weak lemma generation)

Implementation and Experiments

Implementation and Experiments

- **C2LCTRS**: automatic tool to translate C programs to LCTRSs
<http://www.trs.cm.is.nagoya-u.ac.jp/c2lctrs/>

Implementation and Experiments

- **C2LCTRS**: automatic tool to translate C programs to LCTRSs
<http://www.trs.cm.is.nagoya-u.ac.jp/c2lctrs/>
- **Ctrl**: automatic tool to prove equivalence of LCTRS functions
<http://cl-informatik.uibk.ac.at/software/ctrl/>

Implementation and Experiments

- **C2LCTRS**: automatic tool to translate C programs to LCTRSs
<http://www.trs.cm.is.nagoya-u.ac.jp/c2lctrs/>
- **Ctrl**: automatic tool to prove equivalence of LCTRS functions
<http://cl-informatik.uibk.ac.at/software/ctrl/>

| function | YES | NO | MAYBE | time |
|------------|-----|----|-------|------|
| sum | 9 | 0 | 4 | 2.4 |
| fib | 4 | 6 | 3 | 6.6 |
| sumfrom | 3 | 1 | 2 | 1.9 |
| strlen | 1 | 0 | 5 | 7.2 |
| strcpy | 3 | 0 | 3 | 11.5 |
| arrsum | 1 | 0 | 0 | 4.2 |
| fact | 1 | 0 | 0 | 2.4 |
| literature | 4 | 3 | 18 | 4.0 |
| safety | 3 | 2 | 7 | 22.3 |
| total | 29 | 12 | 44 | |

Experiments with student code

Implementation and Experiments

- **C2LCTRS**: automatic tool to translate C programs to LCTRSs
<http://www.trs.cm.is.nagoya-u.ac.jp/c2lctrs/>
- **Ctrl**: automatic tool to prove equivalence of LCTRS functions
<http://cl-informatik.uibk.ac.at/software/ctrl/>

| function | YES | NO | MAYBE | time |
|------------|-----|----|-------|------|
| sum | 9 | 0 | 4 | 2.2 |
| fib | 10 | 1 | 2 | 5.9 |
| sumfrom | 3 | 0 | 3 | 2.3 |
| strlen | 2 | 0 | 4 | 6.0 |
| strcpy | 5 | 0 | 1 | 14.1 |
| arrsum | 1 | 0 | 0 | 4.2 |
| fact | 1 | 0 | 0 | 2.5 |
| literature | 5 | 2 | 18 | 3.9 |
| safety | 3 | 2 | 7 | 22.3 |
| total | 39 | 5 | 41 | |

Experiments with student code and adapted specs
 (ignoring boundary cases like negative input)

Conclusion

- Logically Constrained Term Rewrite Systems for automated reasoning and program analysis

Conclusion

- Logically Constrained Term Rewrite Systems for automated reasoning and program analysis
- Equivalence-preserving frontend to translate from C fragment on integers, arrays, ... to LCTRSs

Conclusion

- Logically Constrained Term Rewrite Systems for automated reasoning and program analysis
- Equivalence-preserving frontend to translate from C fragment on integers, arrays, ... to LCTRSs
- Constrained rewriting induction to prove equivalence of functions defined by LCTRSs

Conclusion

- Logically Constrained Term Rewrite Systems for automated reasoning and program analysis
- Equivalence-preserving frontend to translate from C fragment on integers, arrays, ... to LCTRSs
- Constrained rewriting induction to prove equivalence of functions defined by LCTRSs
- Lemma generation technique suited to problems from imperative programs (second technique in the paper)

Conclusion

- Logically Constrained Term Rewrite Systems for automated reasoning and program analysis
- Equivalence-preserving frontend to translate from C fragment on integers, arrays, ... to LCTRSs
- Constrained rewriting induction to prove equivalence of functions defined by LCTRSs
- Lemma generation technique suited to problems from imperative programs (second technique in the paper)
- Paper:

Carsten Fuhs, Cynthia Kop, Naoki Nishida

Verifying Procedural Programs via Constrained Rewriting Induction

ACM Transactions on Computational Logic 18(2): 14:1-14:50 (2017)